

**Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners**

**Date of Meeting: February 28, 2019 – 3:00 PM**

Location: Detroit Public Safety Headquarters, 1301 Third Street. Detroit, MI 48226

**BOPC Immediate Past Chair Lisa R. Carter called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (February 28, 2019)**

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Excused	
Darryl D. Brown, Vice Chairperson	Excused	
Lisa Carter	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Excused	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton (3:16 PM)	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	8	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for February 28, 2019.

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes:  
Thursday, February 21, 2019

**Board of Police Commissioner Immediate Past Chair Lisa R. Carter welcomed attendees to the meeting and asked for introductions of Commissioners, BOPC and DPD staff and other elected and civic representatives.**

**Chair Lisa Carter** said “Good Afternoon! I am Police Commissioner Lisa Rene Carter, I represent District #6. I serve as the Immediate Past Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting today. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Please note, Commissioners Willie Bell, Elizabeth Brooks and Darryl Brown have requested to be excused from today’s meeting. I want to welcome Ms. Annie Mae Holt as a new member to the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners. Ms. Holt is a resident of the Grandmont Community and a former teacher in the Detroit Public School system. I understand that Ms. Holt was sworn in by the City Clerk early today.” I invite Ms. Annie Mae Holt to address the Board and the audience. Commissioner Annie Mae Holt addressed the Board expressing her thanks for the appointment and indicating her ability to work hard on behalf of the city.

**INVOCATION:** The invocation was provided by Muhammad Ali of the Detroit Chaplain Corp.

**Chairperson’s Report** – Lisa R. Carter said “On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask the Chief of Police during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers. The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM.

Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our citizens are justified in asking “How does civilian oversight of law enforcement help you as a citizen within our community?” Our answer is, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Oversight organizations like the BOPC are at the forefront of investigating, reviewing and auditing individual cases of citizen complaints and patterns of operations by police agencies to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. Our work is based on developing and supporting effective policing. Mutual trust and respect between the police and the community is critical toward increasing the quality of life for residents and visitors to

**Detroit. The Board of Police Commissioners exists to provide civilian oversight for the work of the Detroit Police Department. As a Board, we receive and investigate non-criminal citizens' complaints, monitor the operations of the Department and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to make or modify police policy.**

**I want to point to several important items for your consideration. The Board is continuing to work with NACOLE (National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) to host the National Conference on September 22 thru 26, 2019 in Detroit. During the same time, Detroit will be celebrating our 45<sup>th</sup> year as a civilian oversight organization on July 22, 2019. I will repeat this message several times as we approach the September conference. We are inviting law-enforcement and other civic minded individuals and organizations to join us at the conference. The planning process is well underway, and again we invite your participation.**

**I remind Board members that in the month of March, 2019 our plans are to conduct two community meetings. The first will be on March 7<sup>th</sup> at Western International High School at 1:30 PM. Also, we will have our regular community meeting on March 14<sup>th</sup> at Second Baptist Church, 441 Monroe Street, Downtown Detroit, starting at 6:30 PM.**

**I would like to acknowledge that this is our last meeting to be held during the 2019 Black History Celebration. In the last few meetings, we have highlighted several important historical events related to Black history. This meeting I would like to highlight some local events. The overwhelming majority of the residents of Detroit will agree that Mayor Coleman A. Young represented the spirit of Detroit and is likely to go down in history as the most impressive mayors for the City. According to writer and historian Ken Coleman, in his book, *On this Day in African American History in Detroit*, Ken Coleman documents that on February 1969, Black labor leader and veteran Tuskegee Airman, Coleman Alexander Young testified in front of the U. S. House on Un-American Activities. Coleman Young, by testifying fought against racist bigotry, resisted being tainted as the scourge of the nation because he was Black and held unconventional political views in his day. Coleman Young defended the right of all American workers to organize and fight against racism and economic exploitation. Young's testimony back in 1969 was considered his first step toward becoming a major leader and American icon.**

**Young would be joined by thousands of Black leaders emerging from every walk of life in the Black community. Another individual who remains active today and oftentimes attend meeting of the Board of Police Commissioners is Dr. Arthur Divers. Dr. Divers in 1969 headed the Cotillion Club. The Cotillion Club was an interesting mix of Black professionals and Black business leaders. The Club fought for social justice and is famous for introducing young Black teens to society. The Club infused confidence and good habits into a large number of Blacks who themselves made future contributions to Detroit. But in this case, according to Ken Coleman, Dr. Arthur Divers pressured Detroit Mayor Jerome P. Cavanagh to appoint Blacks to city Boards and Commissions. Historical accounts of this pressure suggest that as a result of Dr. Divers some 30% of Boards and Commissions had Black representation by 1970.**

**Today on our agenda, we will have a resolution honoring the service of retiring Captain Donna Torres. Captain Torres has 30 years of distinguished service to the Department and the people of the city of Detroit. At the appropriate time we will take up the Torres resolution. We also have two presentations scheduled. The first presentation will be a report from DPD Finance on the 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter of our current fiscal year (2018-2019). The report will be presented by Ms. Pam Scales, Deputy Chief Financial Officer for the City of Detroit. The Board received a copy of a PowerPoint presentation around noon today. The presentation is limited. During our last quarterly update, I recall Commissioner Davis questioning the lack of financial documentation as part of the report. I thought that we had agreement that more specific financial information would be shared with the Board. We requested a simple analysis of budgeted revenues to actual expenses grouped by the four funds that finance DPD. We hope to learn if DPD spending levels are in line with the approved budget and comply with the mission of the Department. The second presentation will be from Dr. Polly McCalister who will give the report from the Office of the Chief investigator. We also have a subcommittee report from the Personnel & Training subcommittee related to disqualification appeals for persons interested in attending the Detroit Police Academy. This subcommittee is chaired by Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche. Under Standing and Ad hoc Committee Reports, I will be going to Commissioner Dewaelsche for the report.**

**Later in the meeting we will also go into a closed session to take up the matter of Police Officer Michael Collins, Badge # 352. Officer Collins has been charged with two felonies by the Wayne County Prosecutor, Kim Worthy and Chief Craig has petitioned the Board for a Change in Duty Status to suspend Officer Collins without pay, but with Medical Benefits. This matter will be taken up after public comments. The Board will return to regular order after the closed session to vote on any matters discussed during the closed session.**

In addition to the resolution for Captain Torres, the two presentations and the closed session, we will also have our regular report from the Chief of Police. The Chief will review some of our current crime statistics and update us on any additional police personnel with injuries in the line of duty.

I want to acknowledge the Department's recent Administrative Message, Teletype #19-0132 regarding De-escalation during the use of force incidents. The message walks through the force continuum and various legal cases that impact de-escalation.

We also asked the Chief to update us on any critical issues facing the Department including an update on the Chief's recent press conference wherein the Chief announced his decision to terminate the services of Officer Steele. We also asked the Chief to report on the parallel investigations of Officer Steele's partner and the environmental investigation within the 6<sup>th</sup> Police Precinct. Finally, we asked the Chief to report on two recent news stories. The first is the recent report about one of our officer's who has changed his testimony in the case of Terrance Kellom. The second news report is related to the 911 calls, coverage and response time.

Immediately following our presentations and Q & A from the Board, we will have public comments from the audience. Again, we have adjusted the agenda to move public comments up in advance of the closed session so that we will hear from the public without forcing them to stay until the closed session is over. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the beginning of public comments. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes. Remember, after the closed session the Board will return and handle any votes necessary flowing from the closed session.

**Resolution: Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche read into the record the following resolution honoring the service of retiring Captain Donna Torres.**

### **RESOLUTION HONORING RETIRED CAPTAIN DONNA TORRES**

**WHEREAS** Donna Torres was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on May 8, 1989. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Officer Torres began her career at the Mini Station Section; and

**WHEREAS** Officer Torres's assignments with the Detroit Police Department included the Tactical Service Section, Police Recruiting, Fiscal Management, Support Service Division, Twelfth Precinct, and the Training Academy; and

**WHEREAS** Officer Torres displayed tremendous knowledge and leadership skills as a Police Officer and was promoted to the rank of Sergeant on January 22, 1999. As Sergeant, she was reassigned to the Training Academy; and

**WHEREAS** Sergeant Torres was promoted to the rank of Lieutenant on November 4, 2002 and was assigned to the First Precinct, and later served at the Office of the Chief, Labor Relations, reassigned to the Office of the Chief, and the Twelfth Precinct. On October 7, 2013, Lieutenant Torres was appointed to the rank of Captain, and assigned to the Eighth Precinct. She also served at Training, Communication Operations, Investigative Operations, reassigned to Communications Operations, and the Office of Civil Rights where she served until her retirement; and

**WHEREAS** Captain Torres was the deserving recipient of the following awards: Lifesaving Citation and Medal, Chief's Unit Award, both Consent Judgment Awards, two Chief's Citation and Medals, the Ford Fireworks Awards, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, and the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, as well as numerous letters of commendation from citizens and superiors; and

**WHEREAS** Captain Torres has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 30 years. She has served the Detroit Police Department and the citizens of the City of Detroit with loyalty, professionalism, integrity and dedication, and is widely respected throughout the law enforcement community as the consummate professional.

**NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking on behalf of the citizens of the great City of Detroit recognize and honor the lifelong contributions and commitment to excellence in public service of Captain Donna Torres. Her display of courage and unwavering community spirit has improved the quality of life for the citizens of Detroit. We wish you all the best in your future endeavors. We thank and congratulate you, Captain Donna Torres.

**MOTION: Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche moved the adoption of the resolution honoring the service of retiring Captain Donna Torres. Commissioner William Davis, Second.**

**VOTE: Yes = 8 No = 0 MOTION APPROVED.**

**COP Police Report: Chief of Police James E. Craig** reported that crime is continuing to trend downward as against last year, but that the numbers within the quarter are small in comparison. Chief Craig reported on Crime Intelligence Unit data for the reporting period ending February 28, 2019. Chief Craig reported percentage change between 2018 and 2019, -45% decrease in Homicides, Sexual Assaults 20% increase, Robbery -6% decrease, Carjacking -54% decrease, Aggravated Assaults 5% increase, non-fatal shootings -10% decrease, Burglary -8% decrease, Larceny -20% decrease, Stolen Vehicle -4% decrease and Part 1 offenses -13% decrease. Chief of Police Craig reported that as a result on an internal investigation conducted by Internal Affairs he held a Chief's Hearing in connection with Police Officer Steele and terminated his employment. Craig also indicated that he expects to hold another Chief's Hearing in connection with Police Officers Steele's partner Police Officer Harrison sometime next week. Craig also indicated that the Department is completing its environmental audit of the 6<sup>th</sup> Precinct soon and would share it with the Police Board. Chief Craig, AC James White, Captain Gardner and Lieutenant Ricketts reviewed with the Board several issues related to calls for service and response time. The department reported that on Wednesday 2/27/2019 it received 586 call for service. Of these calls, 158 were priority #1 and 428 had priority other. The intake delay time was 1.25 minutes, quene time, 2.27 minutes and travel time was 7.32 minutes for a total response time of 11:24 minutes. For the prior week the department received 4557 call for service. Of these calls, 1377 were priority #1 and 3180 were considered priority other. The prior week intake delay time was 1.35 minutes, quene time, 3.58 minutes and travel time was 7.11 minutes for a total response time of 12:45 minutes. The report also included priority #1 break down for calls for service, intake delay, quene and travel time for each of DPD's police precincts. The same information was provided for priority two calls and response time. AC White also discussed situations wherein a call is upgraded or downgraded as a result of the situation in the field. He indicated the effort is to track the entire incident and also acknowledged spurious time reading in cases of duplicate events or cases wherein the patrol officers does not report his/her arrival to the scene, but arrives and provides service.

**Presentations to the Board: (A) Report on the Second Quarter of the 2018-2019 Fiscal year by DPD Finance. (B) OCI Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallster.**

**(A) Report on the Second Quarter of the 2018-2019 Fiscal year by DPD Finance.** Mr. Andre Blair summarized the financial activity for July-September and October – December. He indicated for the July –September period the focus was on DOJ Equitable Sharing Program Audit, DPD Towing Operations launched and UltiPro roll out launch. For October –December the focus was on FY 20 Budget preparation, new initiatives, UTGO Bongs and Grants. Mr. Blair reported the Department has received \$27,482,599 in revenues and has expenditures of \$127,988,498 and as of December 31, 2018 is within budget and anticipates ending the fiscal year within the amended budget. Blair indicated 38,000 was received from DOJ Sharing program, \$554,000 from Wayne County and has expended \$1.1 M (Forfeiture Activities). Blair also briefly discussed capital projects. Commissioner William Davis repeated his objection to the type and form of information that is shared by DPD Finance with the Board. Davis recommended that a standard variance report is expected with supporting documentation.

**(B) OCI Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallster** reported from January 2019 OCI accepted and processed 135 citizen complaints. OCI has received 90 complaints in January 2019 as compared to 74 in January 2018, by allegations - use of profanity, incident involving "hit & run" incidents, and electronic evidence (Body Worn Cameras and Electronic Control Weapons). McCallster also reported on false allegations via Body worn Cameras. Below, please see a table for closed January 2019 Citizen Complaints.

135 OCI CCRs CLOSED – January 2019							
207 ALLEGATIONS' FINDINGS							
Allegation	Total	Admin_ Closure (31%)	Exonerated (11%)	Inconclusive (23%)	Sustained (12%)	Unfounded (24%)	
Arrest (1%)	3	1	1	0	0	1	
Demeanor (24%)	49	8	1	13	10	17	
Entry (1%)	2	1	0	1	0	0	
Force (3%)	6	1	1	2	0	2	
Harassment (2%)	4	1	0	1	0	2	
Procedure (43%)	90	29	12	20	12	17	
Property (6%)	12	2	3	2	2	3	
Search (1%)	3	0	0	1	0	2	
Service (18%)	38	21	4	7	1	5	
Total (135 CCRs Closed)	207	64	22	47	25	49	

**BOPC Standing Committee Reports: Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche, Chair of the Personnel & Training subcommittee reported of disqualified applicants to the Detroit Police Academy.**

Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche reported that on February 7, 2019 the Personnel & Training subcommittee meet to discuss disqualification appeals. The members in attendance included Commissioners Rev. Jim Holley, Shirley Burch, Elizabeth Brooks and Dewaelsche. The committee reviewed eight disqualifications appeals

<b>Name of Person with Appeal</b>	<b>Comment / Summary</b>	<b>Recommendation to the Full Board</b>
Savannah Mann	2016 drug use (marijuana) in Seattle, Washington wherein use was legal.	Request for an appeal before the full Board is recommended
Henry Hobbs	Terminated from the Police Academy for failing legal examinations during his training.	Recommendation by committee to request additional information from the academy on the test scores and other information about time at the academy and return information to committee for additional consideration.
Brandon Cauty	Permanently disqualified for excessive behavioral issues.	Recommendation to Full Board to reject applicant appeal for hearing before the full Board.
Ahmad Ahmad	Permanently disqualified for excessive arrest history.	Recommendation to Full Board to reject applicant appeal for hearing before the full Board.
Matthew Spehar	Permanently disqualified for failure to pass Psychological Evaluation (2018).	Recommendation to Full Board to reject applicant appeal for hearing before the full Board.
Xavier Hill	Permanently disqualified for excessive arrest history.	Recommendation to Full Board to reject applicant appeal for hearing before the full Board.
Eric Rhodes-Wright	Permanently disqualified for excessive arrest history.	Recommendation to Full Board to reject applicant appeal for hearing before the full Board.
Jasmine Hamilton	Temporarily disqualified related to driving records.	Recommendation to Full Board to reject applicant appeal for hearing before the full Board.

**MOTION to Approve Personnel & Training Subcommittee Report.**

**Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche** moved that the full Board accept the recommendations contained in her report and direct staff to make any follow-up arrangement or request associated with the report. **Rev. Jim Holley, Second.**

**VOTE: Yes = 8 No = 0 MOTION APPROVED.**

**Report from Secretary to the Board: Mr. Hicks** reported the BOPC has received two request from the Chief of Police,

1. Change of Duty Status for PO Alen Ibrahimovic, Badge 1417, assigned to the Second Precinct, to SWOP but with Medical Benefits
2. Change of Duty Status for PO Diamond Greenwood, Badge 3733, assigned to the Sixth Precinct to SWOP but with Medical Benefits

All appropriate units have been notified including the Detroit Police Officer Association (DPOA). The scheduled hearings are scheduled for March 21, 2019.

**Old Business: None.**

**Oral Communications: Mr. Charles Whitfield** (called, but did not respond to call to speak). **Mr. Eric Blount** expressed his concern that Commissioners vocalize their votes from closed session of the Board going against the recommendation of the

Chief of Police so that the public is advised why they voted. **Mr. Scotty Bowman** questioned if the department had weeded-out any data related to service call response time. **Detroit City Council Member Roy McCallster** welcomed the new Police Commissioner **Annie Holt**. **Ms. Michelle George** applauded the action of Chief Craig in connection with his decision to terminate PO Steele. Ms. George also suggested the need for a Town-Hall meeting to explain to the public the issues of police response time. **Ms. Deana Wilcoxson** applauded the department on the approach and procedural methods used in the Steele investigation and the subsequent decision made by the Chief.

**Announcements:** Next BOPC meeting – March 7, 2019, 1:30 PM at Western International High School, 1500 Scotten St., Detroit 48209. Next community meeting March 14, 2019 at 6:30 PM at Second Baptist Church, 441 Monroe Street, Detroit, 48226 (Downtown Services).

**New Business: Closed Session: Change of Duty Status / Suspension without pay, but with Medical Benefits for PO Michael Collins, Badge #352, assigned to 3<sup>rd</sup> Police Precinct.**

**Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche moved that the Board go into a closed session to discuss a personnel matter involving PO Michael Collins. Commissioner Jim Holley, Second.**

**VOTE:                    Yes = 8                    No = 0                    MOTION APPROVED.**

**The Board reconvened at the call of the Chair at 5:23 PM and returned to regular order, a quorum was in attendance.**

**Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche moved that the Board of Police Commissioners vote to approve the recommendation from the Chief of Police to Change the Duty Status (Suspension without pay, with medical benefits) of Police Officer Michael Collins, Badge # 352.**

**Roll Call Vote:**

**YES= Griffie, Jim Holley, Eva Dewaelsche, Annie Holt, William Davis, Shirley Burch and Lisa Carter (7 members voting in the affirmative to approve the Chief of Police's recommendation)**

**No = None.**

**Abstained = Willie Burton**

**Excused = (Not in attendance) Willie Bell, Elizabeth Brooks and Darryl Brown.**

**VOTE:                    Yes = 7                    No = 0    Abstained =1                    MOTION APPROVED**

**Motion to Adjourn. Adjournment at 5:35 PM.**