

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: 12-12-2018

**Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, 13th Floor Auditorium
Detroit, MI 48226**

Chairperson Hamilton called the meeting to order at 5:42 pm.

ROLL CALL

	ABSENT	PRESENT		ABSENT	PRESENT
Dennis Miriani, Vice Chair	<input type="checkbox"/>	X-late	Katie Johnson	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
James Hamilton, Chair	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	Richard Hosey	<input type="checkbox"/>	X
Alease Johnson	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	Matthew Williams	<input type="checkbox"/>	X
Tiffany Franklin	<input type="checkbox"/>	X-late			

STAFF PRESENT

Jennifer Ross, PDD	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	Taylor Leonard, Law Dept.	<input type="checkbox"/>	X
Brendan Cagney, PDD	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	Pamela Parrish, Law Dept.	<input type="checkbox"/>	X
Ann Phillips, PDD	<input type="checkbox"/>	X			

APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA

Commissioner A. Johnson made a motion to move the following projects to the Consent Agenda for approval as submitted: #18-6008 : 1715 Atkinson

Commissioner Williams – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Staff requested the following changes to the agenda:

- Change “Boston Edison” to “Arden Park – East Boston”
- Remove 2000 Atkinson
- Resolution for 2019 dates (add to agenda)
- Move minutes (Nov. 2018) to end of meeting

Commissioner Hosey made a motion to approve the Agenda as modified.

Commissioner Williams– SUPPORT

Ayes – 4 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

- **Address:** 660 E Boston Boulevard
Historic District: Arden Park
Scope Summary: Erect rear den addition
Interested Party: Marcus Jones, Owners Representative
Public Comment: Letter submitted

Commissioner Williams moved to **ISSUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as proposed in application number 18-5997 because the work as described meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 100 Mack Avenue
Historic District: Brush Park
Scope Summary: Erect new parking garage
Interested Party: Mike Kirk, Architect / Gary Perilli representing Sonia
Public Comment: none

Commissioner Franklin moved to **ISSUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for project as proposed in application number 18-6003 because the work meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 9) *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.* With the following conditions:

- HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the building's final signage proposal
- HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the building's final landscape plan
- The new concrete alley and any new concrete walkways shall be composed of an exposed aggregate, tinted grey, or finished with a clear curing compound so that it not appear "bright white"
- HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve any minor revisions to the project design as long as the work meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 25 W Elizabeth
Historic District: Grand Circus Park
Scope Summary: Demolish existing building and erect new building
Interested Party: Mike Kirk, Architect / Sean O'Brian (Chemical Bank)
Public Comment: Maurice Cox, Nicholas Miller

Commissioner Williams moved to **ISSUE** Certificate Of Approval and a Notice to Proceed with the following conditions:

- Applicant owns building
- All final construction drawings approved by Planning / Zoning / BSEED
- HDC Staff to verify conditions
- HDC Staff to provide feedback / minor revisions

Motion will be sent via email.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

- **Address:** 885 Covington Drive
Historic District: Palmer Park Apartment Buildings
Scope Summary: General rehab
Interested Party: Kevin Brandon- architect / Andrew Kuhn- developer / Eric Brown-developer
Public Comment N/A

Commissioner Miriani moved to **ISSUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work items included for the removal of the existing fencing at the rooftop in application number 18-5993 because the work as described does meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Franklin– SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved to **DENY** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement of the existing windows, the replacement north elevation / primary entrance, the installation of new north elevation balconies, and the replacement of doors at the east and west elevations as per the submitted drawings because the work does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities*

and, wherever possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The applicant needs to come back with a window assessment and better replacement windows, different entry, no balconies and proposed door replacements.

Commissioner Williams– SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 931 Covington Drive
Historic District: Palmer Park Apartment Buildings
Scope Summary: General rehab
Interested Party: Kevin Brandon
Public Comment: N/A

Commissioner Miriani moved to **ISSUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the existing fencing at the rooftop because the work meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes –6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved to **DENY** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement of the existing windows, the replacement north elevation/primary entrance, the installation of new north elevation balconies, and the replacement of doors at the east and west elevations as per the submitted drawings because the work does not meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

The applicant needs to come back with a window assessment and better replacement windows, different entry, no balconies and proposed door replacements.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes –6 Nay –0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 17765 Manderson Drive
Historic District: Palmer Park Apartment Buildings
Scope Summary: Balcony renovations at individual units
Interested Party: Kevin Brandon
Public Comment: N/A

Commissioner Miriani moved to **ISSUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of all existing balconies with new steel-framed balconies proposed in application number 18-6001 because the work as described does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Under the condition that staff approve the color of decking.

Commissioner Williams – SUPPORT
 Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 14500 Grandville Avenue
Historic District: Rosedale Park
Scope Summary: Install aluminum trim at fascia/soffit
Interested Party: Dorthea Cope
Public Comment: N/A

Commissioner Miriani moved to **ISSUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project because the work does meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Conditions:

- Wood siding replace wood siding
- Wood beadboard at soffit replace with w/ wood beadboard
- Keep collector box
- HDC Staff to approve all colors of eaves / rakes
- Break metal wrap to match existing "crown"

Commissioner Williams – SUPPORT
 Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 19666 Renfrew Drive
Historic District: Sherwood Forest
Scope Summary: Replace existing front door and side lights
Interested Party: Ryan A. O'hara, Home Owner
Public Comment: N/A

Commissioner Miriani moved to **ISSUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the security door with a new full-vision storm door only as proposed in application number 18-6004 because the work as described meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Note: The Vista Grand Door (in wood) as presented to the committee is staff approvable.

Commissioner Williams – SUPPORT
 Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATIONS FOR WORK INITIATED/COMPLETED WITHOUT HDC APPROVAL NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

Address: 253 Erskine
Historic District: Brush Park
Scope Summary: Replace historic front porch with new front porch, new design
Interested Party: David Camelleri, Owner
Public Comment: N/A

Commissioner Miriani moved to **DENY** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the current porch because the work does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Number 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Williams – SUPPORT
 Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved to **ISSUE AN ORDER** (written by J. Ross) to the applicant which requires the replication (in dimension, detailing, design, color, texture, and material) of the front

porch that was removed without permit and/or HDC approval (see attached photo) on or before 6/1/2019. New porch requires staff approval.

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

- **Address:** 550 W Fort
Historic District: *ADJACENT TO* Fort Shelby HD
Scope Summary: Demolish building and establish parking lot
Interested Party: Jerome, Emmett Moten
Public Comment: Eric Kehoe- Preservation Detroit, Mellissa Arrowsmith- MHFN, Nicholas Miller, James Sobeveski, Francis Grunow, Karen Hammer, Chris Hefty

After review, Commissioner A. Johnson moved demo of building will have a negative effect on adjacent historic district.

Commissioner Mirani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5 Nay – 0

(Hosey recused due to relationship with owner)

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 1401 Rivard
Historic District: *ADJACENT TO* Lafayette Park HD
Scope Summary: Establish new development
Interested Party: Nathan Kemp –Developer, Diana Koter- Architect
Public Comment: none

After review, Commissioner A. Johnson moved that proposed demolition will benefit the adjacent Historic District.

Commissioner Mirani – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

- **Address:** 47 E Adams
Historic District: Women's Exchange Building
Scope Summary: Conceptual design review of new side addition
Interested Party: Devan Anderson, Frank F.

Public Comment: none

After review, Commission is generally in favor of proposal.

MOTION CARRIED

- **RESOLUTION FOR 2019 HDC DATES**

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

- **NOVEMBER 14 MEETING MINUTES**

Commissioner Miriani moved to **APPROVE Nov. 14 Meeting Minutes**

Commissioner A. Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Franklin motioned to adjourn the meeting at 10:06

All Commissioners– SUPPORT

Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

MOTION CARRIED

MEETING ADJOURNED