

**Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners**  
**Date of Meeting: December 15, 2016 – 3:00 PM**  
 Location: Detroit Public Safety Headquarters 1301 Third Ave., Detroit Michigan

**Chairman Willie Bell called the BOPC meeting to order at 3:00 PM (December 15, 2016)**

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chair	Yes	
Ricardo R. Moore, Vice Chair	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Excused	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
Lisa Carter	Excused	
Reginald Crawford	Yes	
Eva Dewaelsche	Yes	
Conrad Mallett	Yes	
Derrick Sanders	Yes	
Richard Shelby	Excused	
Bishop Edgar Vann	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	8	

**The Board acted in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for December 15, 2016.**

**The Board acted in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes:  
 Thursday, December 8, 2016**

**BOPC Officers Reports(s):** After welcome and opening remarks **Chairman Bell** asked Commissioner Vann to do the invocation. **Chairman Bell** asked the Commissioners in attendance to introduce themselves and add any comments to the record.

**Under Chairman’s Report, Bell gave the following report.**

**Item #1: Promotions and Appointments**

As I have indicated in the past, the **BOPC is concerned about the overall process of promotions and appointments** within the Department. While we have several outstanding questions, today I would like to have Human Resources Director **Gail Oxendine clarify one concern**. In the past, **I believe you indicated HR was working on an examination for the rank of Detectives**. As a supplement to your report tonight, please comment on the progress, if any, on the examination for Detectives?

**Item #2: HB6074 to HB 6086.**

**Last week, I wanted to address situation in Lansing involving HB 6074 thru 6086.** These bills, had they been acted upon, would have changed several things, but most importantly caused retirees to pay for gaps in their retirement health benefits. The package would have also required local government to stop providing retirement health care for new employees. The bills would have created health savings accounts paid for by the new employees who would bet their future health needs on the fortunes of Wall Street.

**Thanks to municipal employees across the State including police, fire and other municipal employees, the Legislature has decided they would not take up these bills in their lame-duck session. It is highly likely that they will take up these bills in January, 2017.**

I understand hundreds of municipal employees marched on Lansing to protest this package of bills. Thanks should go to **Mark Young and others** who helped pull together this successful mobilization to voice local concern in Lansing.

The **last word from Lansing** is the Governor will be **appointing a taskforce to advise him** and the legislature on legislative approaches to achieve the same ends as HB 6074 - HB 6086. They expect to have a package in June or July. So again, stay tuned.

### Item #3: BOPC Sponsored Resolutions

Several meetings ago, we had one of our members express concern about **how and when we sponsor BOPC Board Resolutions**. Resolutions are important as a voice for bodies like ours. I have attempted to leave the door open for opportunities to congratulate heroic work of police personnel, applauded special individuals and organizations involved in law enforcement and to give special recognition to people in the broad law enforcement or criminal justice system.

Our body is not the Detroit City Council, the Michigan Legislature, nor is it Congress. Our scope and responsibility is very narrow in comparison to other bodies.

**Under BOPC Chairperson Lisa Carter, back in September, 2015, we discussed and agreed** to general guidelines and a procedure to take and consider BOPC resolutions. Chairperson Carter also asked former Secretary to the Board George Anthony to take our general guidelines and create a document reflecting our agreement.

The document is contained in a **September 24, 2015 e-mail titles Awards Protocol**. The document is also attached to your Board package.

Generally speaking, the protocol allows for testimonial resolutions for

- (1) **Retirements,**
- (2) **Matters related to law enforcement,**
- (3) **Matters affecting quality of life in connection with the criminal justice system,**
- (4) **Acts of heroism and**
- (5) **Extraordinary acts of service,** again related to the field of service we are involved.

I am bring this matter back to the table so that we can re-affirm our actions and demonstrate that our testimonial resolutions speak to high or exceptional standards of achievement within the system of criminal justice. I ask each member to review this document and, for the record, I ask that we re-affirm these guidelines tonight. **With this the Chair will accept a motion to re-affirm the awards protocol as document in the George Anthony communications dated September 24, 2015.**

**Motion:** Motion to re-affirm Guidelines the content of George Anthony communications to the Board dated September 25, 2015 on Award Protocol for BOPC Resolutions (Mallett)

**Second:** (Vann)

**Vote:** Yes = 7                      No = 1(Burton)                      Abst = 0                      (Excused = 3)                      **Action: Approved**

### Item #4: DPD Budget.

**Our hope was to review and act on the DPD Budget at this meeting. I understand we have several outstanding questions still yet to be addressed.** Deputy CFO Pam Scales has indicated that the Department budget was due to the Budget Department yesterday. While we never had a firm date for the transmission of the proposed budget to the Budget Department, I understand two things are in progress.

(1) The **BOPC staff is still working with DPD and the CFO's Office to address some of our issues.** As these issues are addressed and following the approval of the budget by this body we will transmit our concerns to be incorporated into the Budget Department presentation to the Mayor.

(2) To meet the Department's deadline the **DPD Agency CFO has forwarded the preliminary information on the budget to the Budget Department.** This will allow the Budget Department to begin its work, and again, **they have assured us that comments and concerns of the BOPC will be taken into consideration** as they finalize the budget moving it to the Detroit City Council.

### Item #5: Today's Order of Business.

We have one personnel matter that might require us to go into **closed session**, we have a **presentation from HR** and we had a scheduled presentation from the **law department in connection with enforcement of Marijuana shops. I understand the**

**Law department has called and asked to reschedule their presentation.** I am asking the OCI report to be moved to our next meeting given the closed session.

**For the Close session, if we go into the session, we will adjourn our regular meeting to the call of the Chair and will reconvene immediately afterward to taken any action flowing from the closed session. The closed session meeting will be down the hall.**

**Bell** discussed attending the DPD promotional ceremony and also asked OCI Chief Drake to add any comments about the recent promotional ceremony for Lieutenants and Sergeants. Bell concluded his report by acknowledging Sharon Pannell for hosting the Christmas party for Citizen Police Academy.

**Chief of Police Report:** Representing Chief James Craig was AC Steven Dolunt. **Dolunt** discussed a fatal auto accident in Highland Park, Michigan involving a DPD officer and DPD car that hit a 14 year old citizen, Middle-Eastern Law Enforcement program, and a limited amount of the crime statistics gathered by Compstat. Dolunt was asked (**Crawford**) about crime statistics for the past month and the circumstances around the jurisdictional responsibilities of the Department in investigating fatal accidents in other cities (Highland Park) Dolunt indicated he was at the scene and inquired of Highland Park and discussed with a responding patrol associated with the State Police who would take the investigative lead in the above fatal accident. Dolunt indicate, as it was his call, after consulting with others he would accept the responsibilities for violating Department rules, if in fact a violation had occurred. **Vann** also asked Dolunt about the protocol for assisting homeless and other people in the extreme weather, Dolunt indicated the department makes attempts to get people off the street and they use three warming centers (1464 Webb, NSO and Detroit Recuse Mission). He indicated the transport to these locations are voluntary. **Crawford** also directed the Commission’s attention to an articles in *American Police Beat*, December 2, 2016 edition addressing the level of support for law enforcement as delineated in a recent poll.

**Presentation to the Board: Monthly Human Resources Report.**

**HR Director Gail Qxendine** responded to the Chairman’s question indicating that after the current list of Detectives is deemed expired by the Chief of Police, the intent is to establish a future list by written examination. The list is scheduled to expire June 2018. Qxendine indicated the recent past practice was established by an arbitration award under the Emergency Manager. **Bell** requested that “**moving forward any information impacting the Department like arbitration awards and Collective Bargaining Agreements should also be shared with the Commission** so that in our deliberation the Commission can include all critical informational components in their judgment.” Next, Oxendine gave a report of the recruitment and hires statistics for the past month. The report is on file in the Commission’s office. Qxendine indicated for November 2016,

Employment Category	Positions Filled	Positions Vacant	Total Positions
Sworn	2358	204	2562
Civilian	506	55	561
Total	2864	259	3123

Additionally, new hires for November are Sworn (30), Civilian (5) and Police Assistants (3) for a total of 38 FTE’s. The Detroit residency information as of November 30, 2016,

Residency	Total Sworn	Total Civilian
Detroit	634	322
Non-Detroit	1736	184

The report also included figures on attrition (17) and Leave of Absence / Restricted Duty data.

**BOPC Standing and Ad hoc Committee Reports:** No Reports.

**Board Secretary Report:** No Report.

**New Business:** Resolution read by **Eva Dewaelsche** for the retirement of **Erminia Ramirez**.

**RESOLUTION HONORING  
COMMISSIONER ERMINIA RAMIREZ**

**WHEREAS** Erminia Ramirez, a life-long resident of the City of Detroit, was appointed by former Mayor Kwame M. Kilpatrick on February 14, 2003 to serve on the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners during the tenure of former Police Chief Jerry Oliver; and

**WHEREAS** Commissioner Ramirez was highly active in her community, yet immediately embraced her responsibility to ensure accountability and provide oversight to the Detroit Police Department; and

**WHEREAS** Commissioner Ramirez witnessed the historical appointment of Detroit's first female Chief of Police Ella M. Bully-Cummings, and through this transition, remained focused and worked strategically to strengthen citizen and police relationships; and

**WHEREAS** Commissioner Ramirez, going beyond the call of duty, served twice as the Board's Chairperson, while serving on several Board subcommittees which included Citizen Complaints, Disciplinary Appeals, Personnel & Training and Budget; and

**WHEREAS** Commissioner Ramirez upheld her responsibilities to the Board simultaneously with her professional duties as the Chief Operating Officer of the Community Health and Social Services Center (CHASS). Now she serves as the Director of CHASS by identifying program needs/gaps and make recommendations to the Chief Executive Officer. Promote public engagement, represent CHASS at various events. Assist in building public relationships to maintain and enhance a comprehensive primary health, and a centered medical home for the residents of Detroit and the surrounding communities. Holding a Bachelor of Arts degree in Psychology from the University of Michigan and a Masters Degree in Social Work from Wayne State University, Commissioner Ramirez has devoted her entire life's work to serving diverse populations within the City of Detroit; and

**WHEREAS** Commissioner Ramirez continues to devote time to several boards and affiliations, such as the Detroit Future City, Board Member of Blue Cross Blue Shield Latino Roundtable, Henry Ford Hospital Latino Stakeholder, Congress of Communities, Clark Park Schools & Neighborhood Initiatives, Community Action Against Asthma, Community Outreach & Education Core (COEC) U of M, Chairwoman ALPACT (Advocates & Leaders for Police and Community Trust), Hispanic Police Officer Association, and MANA a National Latina Organization de Metro Detroit Member; and

**WHEREAS** Commissioner Ramirez has received numerous service awards and letters of commendation from schools, churches, organizations, corporations and businesses for her generous spirit and unwavering commitment to leadership. Always seen networking to better her community and the City, Commissioner Ramirez is loved and highly respected by all those who know her; and

**NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**

That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking on behalf of the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, recognize and highly honor the enduring dedication of Commissioner Erminia Ramirez. Her talent and selflessness have proven to be invaluable assets to the City of Detroit; and be it further resolved that the Commissioners of this Board thank and congratulate you on your perseverance and determination to promote the mission of the Board and the Detroit Police Department after six (6) highly productive years of devoted service to the Board of Police Commissioners.

We salute and honor you, Commissioner Erminia Ramirez.

**Motion:** Motion to honor former Police Commissioner Erminia Ramirez. (Vann)

**Second:** (Moore)

**Vote:** Yes = 7      No = 0      Abst = 0      (Excused = 3)      **Action: Approved**

**Oral Communications:** None

**Request to Go into Closed Session:**

**Under the Open meeting Act the act allow for a closed session to consider personnel matters (MCL 15.268(a), Section 8(a).**

**Motion:** Motion to go into Closed Session to consider an appeal to the Board for Police Applicate Loren Courts and to return at the Call of the Chair (Moore)

**Second:** (Vann)

**Vote:** Yes = 7                      No = 0                      Abst = 0                      (Excused = 3)                      **Action: Approved**

**Board reconvened at the Call of the Chair**

**Motion:** Motion to grant the appeal by Loren Courts and to allow the applicate to re-apply to the Detroit Police Academy/ Police Recruitment. (Sanders)

**Second:** (Vann)

**Vote:** Yes = 5                      No = 2(Mallet, Moore)                      Abst = 1(Burton)                      (Excused = 3)                      **Action: Approved**

**Bell:** If no other business before this body? Motion in order.

**Motion:** Motion to Adjourn (**Mallett**)

**Second:** No objections.

**Bell: Meeting Adjourned.**

Next Meetings: Regular Thursday, January 5, 2017 @ Detroit Public Safety headquarters – 3:00 PM

Next Community Meeting, January 12, 2017, 12<sup>th</sup> Precinct, Unity Church, 17505 Second Avenue Detroit, MI 48203